

A Pesticide Decision-Making Guide to Protect Pollinators in Tree Fruit Orchards

2018 Edition

By Maria van Dyke, Emma Mullen, Dan Wixted, and Scott McArt



Contents

Choosing lower-risk pesticides for pollinators in New York orchards	_ 1
How to use this guide	3
Understanding the terms in this guide	_ 4
EPA Pesticide toxicity standards	_ 4
Synergistic Interactions	_ 4
Systemic Pesticides	4
Adjuvants and/or inert ingredients	_ 5
Tying it all together: adopting an Integrated Pest and Pollinator Management (IPPM) approach	_ 5
IPPM: Putting the "pollinator" in IPM:	_ 6
Table 1: Product formulations and their active ingredients	_ 7
Table 2: Pesticide synergies and acute, chronic, and sublethal toxicities for honey bees and other	
pollinators	9
Literature cited	_24
Appendix A: Pollination contract	28

Acknowledgments

This research and development of this guide was supported by the New York State Environmental Protection Fund and New York Farm Viability Institute grant FOC 17-001. The expert advice and consultation provided by Dan Wixted of the Cornell Pesticide Management Education Program was supported by the Crop Protection and Pest Management Extension Implementation Program [grant no. 2017-70006-27142/project accession no. 1014000] from the USDA National Institute of Food and Agriculture.

Choosing lower-risk pesticides for pollinators in New York orchards

Growers recognize the vital role of pollination and understand that managing pests while protecting pollinators can be a balancing act. Both components are essential for a successful harvest, yet they can sometimes be in conflict with one another. Pollinators (mostly bees) are busy pollinating orchard blossoms at the same time growers need to be managing specific pests and diseases. The impact of pesticides on pollinator health has been an active area of research in recent years, including work conducted in New York orchards and elsewhere. The results from this research are clear: Pesticides can be a threat to pollinators, but there is variation in risk, due in part to grower management practices. This guide summarizes known impacts of pesticides on bees in a clear, concise, easy-to-use format. Our goal is to provide information to growers so they can develop an effective Integrated Pest and Pollinator Management program.

Pesticide risk to pollinators comes from a combination of *exposure* and *effects*. Pollinators may be *exposed* to pesticides in several ways: through contact with direct sprays, puddle water, guttation droplets, extrafloral nectaries, pollen and nectar from treated crops and surrounding wildflowers, and residues in soil (for ground nesting bees). Pesticides have an *effect* on pollinators if exposure is sufficient to cause lethal or sub-lethal impacts. Recently, an understanding of the interactions between pesticides on bee health has brought focus on active ingredients that synergize, meaning that A native Andrena species grooming cherry pollen from its face. the combined toxicity is greater than the



sum of the toxicity of each pesticide applied separately. Pesticide risk studies find that synergies among different pesticides can increase the toxicity of some pesticides up to 1000-fold. While some synergies are intentional and make a higher efficacy formulation, many synergies can lead to unintentional combined effects that can substantially increase pesticide risk to bees. These are beyond the scope of EPA label guidelines.

In summary, 48 of the 140 chemicals listed in this guide have been shown to synergize with other agrochemicals in tank mixes, formulations, or on plant or soil surfaces. These chemicals include some fungicides, neonicotinoids, pyrethroids, carbamates, organophosphates, piperonyl butoxide and some adjuvants. Synergisms are noted with a 👹 in Table 2, 'Synergies and acute, chronic, and sublethal toxicities for honey bees and other pollinators.'

This guide summarizes reported pesticide effects as of October 2018. The guide presents the most up-todate information about the impacts of fungicides, insecticides, microbicides, and growth regulators on bees that pollinate tree fruits. New York is home to 416 species of bees, and over 120 species are known to be important for NYS apple pollination, with several of those species also visiting other tree fruits. It is well documented that bee species can respond differently to active ingredients. However, there are so many bee species, each differing with respect to physiology, sociality, nesting habits, foraging habits, and ability to tolerate pesticides, that it is unrealistic to determine how every use of every pesticide will affect each species. Therefore, the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) uses acute toxicity to honey bees (Apis mellifera) as a proxy for the potential adverse effects of a pesticide on bees in general, but will at times take studies on other bee species into account as appropriate. In addition to presenting these EPA toxicity ratings, this guide specifically highlights the chemical combinations that produce synergistic effects on bee pollinators. Furthermore, we expand on EPA standards to include reports of sublethal effects (e.g., reduced reproductive output) in honey bees as well as acute, chronic, and sublethal effects on bumble bee and solitary bee species that support agricultural pollination.

This guide is intended to be used as a decisionmaking tool. The primary goal of this guide is to help



growers understand and compare the acute toxicity and synergistic effects of different pesticides on pollinators. The majority of registered products for New York orchard management are included and assigned a score of "highly toxic", "moderately toxic", or "practically non-toxic". Growers can easily compare the toxicity ratings of various pesticides to help them choose a product that is effective against target pests but poses minimal risk to bees. The <u>Pollinator Network @ Cornell</u> will update this guide as new research becomes available. This guide is intended to be a companion to the *Cornell Pest Management Guidelines for Commercial Tree Fruit Production*.

How to use this guide

This guide consists of a series of tables that summarize all the known products and their associated active ingredients used in orchard production. It also includes miticides that are used by beekeepers in New York. Growers and applicators can most effectively use this guide by following three steps:

- 1. Locate specific pesticide products in **Table 1** to determine the product's active ingredients.
- 2. Go to Table 2 to find active ingredient toxicity ratings and known synergisms.
- 3. When possible, choose to apply products that are effective on target pests but least toxic to bees and do not synergize with other products used.

Table 1: Product formulations and their active ingredients lists most but not all registered tree fruit pesticides alphabetically by product name so it's easy to find the associated active ingredient. If a product name is not in this product formulation list, please be aware that the active ingredient is always listed on the product label. Information on toxicity and synergy is organized by active ingredient in **Table 2**.



Table 2: Synergies and acute, chronic, and sublethal toxicities for honey bees and other pollinators lists all the active ingredients alphabetically, noting EPA honey bee acute toxicity ratings, ability to synergize, and sublethal effects or impacts to non-honey bee pollinators. Pesticides are grouped according to class: A) fungicides, antibiotics, and inert ingredients, and B) insecticides (including insect growth regulators) and adjuvants. In the 3rd to 5th columns of **Table 2**, the EPA's acute toxicity ratings for adult honey bees are reported with the symbol if a synergy has been documented. Notes on the active ingredients that cause synergistic interactions, as well as information on sublethal impacts or impacts to other bee species is outlined in the 6th column. Timing of spray is typically noted on the label, and we encourage applicators to use the most conservative timing when a potentially synergistic combination must be used.

While this guide has highlighted all laboratory and field experiments that have measured synergies beween active ingredients, and the sublethal, chronic, and developmental impacts of pesticides to honey bees (*Apis mellifera*) and other bee species, it is not an exhaustive list of all product formulations or all pesticides used in agriculture. The toxicity ratings in columns 3-5 of this guide refer to current registration standards set forth by the EPA based on acute toxicity of pesticides to adult honey bees. Where additional considerations for other



Bombus impatiens on a cherry flower.

bee species, chronic toxicity, sublethal toxicity, or larval or pupal toxicity are known from scientific literature, we have included these risks in the 'Pesticide synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to pollinators other than the honey bee' column in Table 2.

Understanding the terms in this guide

Pesticide toxicity (i.e. acute toxicity)

Acute toxicity is the dose or concentration of an active ingredient that it takes to kill 50% of bees that come into contact with it within 48 hours. The lethal dose of an ingredient is referred to as the LD_{50} value. Acute pesticide toxicity is grouped into three categories:

highly toxic (LD₅₀ < 2 μg/bee), moderately toxic (LD₅₀ 2 - 10.99 μg/bee) practically non-toxic (LD₅₀ > 11 μg/bee)

The EPA is currently working to adjust their registration standards to address risk, which consolidates toxicity data with exposure predicted from field application rates. These risk rankings will be available in a few years and, when they are, will be included or referenced in a future edition of this guide.

Synergistic Interactions

Traditionally, pesticide toxicity evaluates one active ingredient at a time. With our growing understanding of the multitude of pesticides bees come into contact with simultaneously, we now know that to understand the overall risk posed to bees in the environment, we need to measure how mixtures of pesticides interact with one another. Some pesticides commonly used in orchard management have been identified as synergists (see Table 2). Certain classes of fungicides and adjuvants are commonly reported to synergize with insecticides to create greater than expected effects on bees. For instance, the combination of DMI fungicides (e.g. myclobutanil, difenoconazole, propiconazole) with some pyrethroids or neonicotinoids have been found to create these effects. This guide highlights active ingredients that are known synergists and the mixtures that should be avoided whenever possible to mitigate risk to bees. This information is especially helpful when planning tank mixes and spray regimes. Keep in mind that the conditions for synergy can vary depending on formulation, weather, and time since application of an active ingredient. While we understand that tank mixing is a cost-effective and time-saving practice, we encourage pesticide applicators to identify and avoid certain pesticide combinations that are likely to cause synergisms, noted in Table 2.

Systemic Pesticides

"Systemic" pesticides are able to protect the entire plant instead of one isolated part of the plant. The pesticide is translocated within the plant from the point of soil uptake to the



The life cycle of a solitary ground nesting bee. Bees can be exposed to pesticides in soil and in the pollen and nectar they consume as larvae. Photos by Laura Russo.

petals, leaves, stem, roots, pollen and nectar to protect the plant from a variety of pests. Unfortunately, this also means that these pesticides can be present in pollen, nectar, and guttation droplets for days or weeks, which can result in exposure to pollinators. The most common systemic pesticides are the

neonicotinoids (acetamiprid, clothianidin, dinotefuran, imidacloprid, nitenpyram, thiacloprid, thiamethoxam) and fipronil, a phenylpyrazole insecticide. A real conundrum we face is that some sytemics are only in NY because they are seed coatings on other crops planted in other fields that bees forage in at the same time as apple bloom, increasing the potential for synergy. Some neonicotinoids can persist in the soil for years and be taken up by nearby plants at any time creating a high likelihood for bee exposure and potential to synergize with other pesticides.

Adjuvants and/or inert ingredients

Adjuvants are chemicals added to a pesticide spray mix to improve performance. Inert ingredients are chemicals in a pesticide product formulation aside from the active ingredient(s). We have included some of these chemicals in Table 2 because recent findings have demonstrated that they are highly toxic to bees (for example, N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone and organosilicones). The literature on this topic is young, therefore we do not highlight it in this guide.

Tying it all together: adopting an Integrated Pest and Pollinator Management (IPPM) approach to protect pollinators

Growers and pesticide applicators have already made marked adjustments for the protection of bees by following pesticide label guidelines. Pesticide labels inform users about bee precautions in a "Bee Advisory Box", in the "Directions for Use" section, and/or in the "Environmental Hazards Statement" section of the product label. These precautions include information about the time, temperature, and wind speeds under which pesticides can be safely applied, and may specify additional requirements for reducing drift. Whether growers work closely with a consultant, or a distributor, they must when using a typical airblast sprayer. always read the pesticide label carefully.



county extension educator, a crop Spraying in low-wind conditions can reduce drift, especially

When reading the label, always note the crops for which the pesticide is registered, the proper mixing rate, the proper method of application, and the proper timing (e.g., weather conditions, time of day, stage of bloom) for minimizing negative impacts on non-target organisms and humans. Take note of the active ingredient name(s). Also note the compatibility of the pesticide with other products that will be applied at the same time or in the same tank mix. Applicators should verify that the product is currently registered in their region of New York by searching the products listed in the New York State Pesticide Administration Database (NYSPAD): http://www.dec.ny.gov/nyspad/. If applicators are using this guide in another state, they should check their state's pesticide registration database or the National Pesticide Information Retrieval System (NPIRS) to determine which pesticides are registered for their use: http://npirspublic.ceris.purdue.edu/state/.

An integrated pest and pollinator management approach requires growers to be aware of their pest populations through scouting early and often, to use non-chemical methods to delay the need for chemical applications, and when pesticides are warranted, to choose products that are effective and pose the lowest risk to bees and other non-target organisms.

IPPM: Putting the "Pollinator" in IPM:

- 1) Read the entire product label to find pollinator protection guidelines during application, and follow label directions.
- 2) Select pesticides that are effective against target pests, but least toxic to bees.
- 3) Avoid using pesticides or tank mixing pesticides and adjuvants that are noted in this guide to synergize with each other.
- 4) Choose sprayer nozzles and settings that reduce drift. Follow label directions regarding wind speed and temperature inversions to avoid drift to areas of potential bee habitat at field edges.
- 5) Unless the product label notes otherwise, avoid applying insecticides when high humidity at low temperatures are forecasted following application. *Dew is common under these* conditions, which allows residues to remain toxic up to twice as long.
- 6) Prevent bees from visiting the orchard floor while pesticides are being applied by frequently mowing broadleaf weeds (e.g., dandelions). Leaving flowers on the orchard floor can expose bees to pesticides.
- 7) Follow label directions to reduce contamination of surface waters (e.g., irrigation ditches, retention ponds, creeks, etc). Bees actively collect water and mud from these sources.

8) Develop a communication strategy to

alert nearby beekeepers at least 24 hours in advance of applying a highly toxic pesticide. Consider using a written pollination contract with beekeepers who provide pollination services to discuss an IPPM plan in advance. An example template can be found in Appendix A of this guide.

lanes can protect bees from pesticides exposure.

Bees visit plants in field edges even when a crop is not in bloom





Table 1. Product formulations and their active ingredients

Product Name	Active ingredient	Product Name	Active ingredient	Product Name	Active ingredient
Fungicides, antib	iotics and inert	Elatus	benzovindiflupyr	Polyram 80 DF	metiram
ingredients		Elevate	fenhexamid	Presidio*	fluopicolide
Abamectin	N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone	Empress Intrinsic	pyraclostrobin	Pristine fungicide	boscalid + pyraclostrobin
(inaredient in)	(NMP)	Encartis	boscalid + chlorothalonil	Procure*	triflumizole*
Abound	azoxystrobin	Endura	boscalid	Propi Max	propiconazole
Academy	difenoconazole +	Equus products	chlorothalonil	Pure Spray	mineral oil
, , , ,	fludioxonil	Ethos§	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens	Quadris Ridomil	azoxystrobin +
Acadia	azoxystrobin	Exilis plus	N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone	Gold SL	mefenoxam
Actigard	acibenzolar-s-methyl	Exponent	piperonyl butoxide	Quadris F	azoxystrobin
Aframe	azoxystrobin	Ferbam	ferbam	Quadris Opti	azoxystrobin +
Agricure	potassium bicarbonate	Fireline	oxytetracycline	a	chlorothalonil
Agri-mycin	streptomycin	Firewall	streptomycin	Quadris Top	azoxystrobin +
AgriTin*	triphenyltin hydroxide*	Flint	trifloxystrobin	a	difenoconazole
Alamo	propiconazole	Flint Extra	trifloxystrobin	Quali-Pro	mefenoxam
Aliette	fosetyl-al	Fontelis	penthiopyrad	Quash	metconazole
Alsa*	propiconazole	Fortix	flutriafol	Quilt	azoxystrobin +
Amistar	difenoconazole	Fortuna	mancozeb	0 11 1	propiconazole
Aprovia	benzovindiflupyr	Freshgard	imazalil	QuiltXcel	azoxystrobin +
AproviaTop	benzovindiflupyr +	Fungaflor	imazalil	Outinte	propiconazole
	difenoconazole	Fungazil	imazalil	Quintec	quinoxyfen
Ardent (ingredient	N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone	Fungisol	debacarb	Rally 40 WSP	myclobutanil
in)	(NMP)	Gem 500 SC	trifloxystrobin	Ranman 400SC	cyazofamid
Azoxystar	azoxystrobin	Glacial Spray	mineral oil	Regalia Revitaliza S	reynoutria
Badge SC & X2§	copper oxychloride +	Heritage	azoxystrobin	Revitalize§	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens
	copper hydroxide	Incognito 4.5F	thiophanate-methyl	Rhyme	flutriafol
Banner Maxx	propiconazole	Indar2F	fenbuconazole	Rovral 4 F*	iprodione
Biocover	mineral oil	Initiate	chlorothalonil	Scala	pyrimethanil
Bonide complete	captan	InspireSuper	difenoconazole +	Scholar	fludioxonil
fruit tree spray	-	Investige 25 Calent*	cyprodinil	Serenade§	Bacillus subtilis
Bonide Fruit Tree &	boscalid+pyraclostrobin+	Iprodione2F Select*	iprodione	Sonata§	Bacillus subtilis
Plant Guard	lambda-cyhalothrin	Kaligreen	potassium bicarbonate	Sonoma 20 EW AG	myclobutanil
Bordeaux§	copper sulfate	Kasumin 2L	kasugamycin	Sonoma 40 WSP	myclobutanil
BravoUltrex	chlorothalonil	Kestrel Mex*	propiconazole	Sovran	kresoxim-methyl
Bromazil	imazalil	Kocide§ Kodiak§	copper hydroxide Bacillus subtilis	Streptrol SubdueGR	streptomycin
Bumper 250 EC*	propiconazole	-		Sulfur	mefenoxam- nonbearing sulfur
BVA	mineral oil	Liquid Copper Products§	copper octanoate	SuperTin*	
C.O.C.S.	copper oxychloride +	Luna Sensation [†]	fluonuram		triphenyltin hydroxide* dodine
	copper sulfate		fluopyram + trifloxystrobin	Syllit FL Tartan	trifloxystrobin
Cabrio EG	pyraclostrobin	Luna Tranguility†	fluopyram + pyrimethanil	Temprano	N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone
Camelot O§	copper octanoate	ManKocide	mancozeb + copper	(ingredient in)	(NMP)
Cannonball	fludioxonil	WallKoclue	hydroxide	Terraguard*	triflumizole*
Captan 50 WP	captan	Mantis	propiconazole	Tilt	propiconazole
Captan 80 WDG	captan	Manzate Flowable*	mancozeb	Topguard†	flutriafol
Captec 4L	captan	Manzate Max T&O	mancozeb	Topguard EQ [†]	azoxystrobin+flutriafol
CaptEvate	fenhexamid + captan	Manzate ProStick	mancozeb	Topsin M	thiophanate-methyl
Catamaran	chlorothalonil + potassium	Marazo	propiconazole	Tourney	metconazole
	phosphite	Mastercop§	copper sulfate	Triathlon§	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens
Cease§	Bacillus subtilis	Menara	propiconazole	Ultra Flourish	mefenoxam
Champ§	copper hydroxide	Merivon Xemium*†	fluxapyroxad +	Vanguard WG	cyprodinil
Cherokee	propiconazole		pyraclostrobin	Vault§	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens
Civitas Turf	mineral oil	Meteor*	iprodione	Velum Prime*†	fluopyram
Contans	Coniothyrium minitans	MilStop	potassium bicarbonate	Vivando	metrafenone
Crystalline BASF*	pyraclostrobin	MoncoatMZ	flutolanil + mancozeb	Warden RTA	mefenoxam + fludioxanil
products		Monterey§	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens	Ziram	ziram
Cueva§	copper octanoate	Mural	benzovindiflupyr	Zoro (ingredient in)	N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone
Cuprofix Ultra§	copper sulfate	MycoShield	oxytetracycline		(NMP)
Cuproxat§	copper sulfate	Natria§	Bacillus subtilis	Products with ing	secticide and fungicide
Curzate 60 DF	cymoxanil	Nevado*	iprodione		
Damoil	mineral oil	Omni	mineral oil	mixtures	Descalid to Due to the 21
Decco Pyr. 400 SC	pyrimethanil	Oreon	PCNB (quintozene or	Bonide fruit tree &	Boscalid + Pyraclostrobin
Deccozil	imazalil fan hannan id		pentachloronitrobenzene)	plant guard	+ Lambda-cyhalothrin
Decree	fenhexamid	Ortho Elements	copper octanoate	Insecticides. Inse	ct growth regulators
Dithane	mancozeb	Garden§		and adjuvants	
Double Nickel§	Bacillus amyloliquefaciens	PBO-8	piperonyl butoxide		
Echo 90 DF & Lite	chlorothalonil	Penbotec 400 SC	pyrimethanil	Abamex Aceto*†	abamectin
Fallman Tout				ACETO" T	bifenthrin
Eclipse Turf EFOG-160-PYR storage	iprodione pyrimethanil	Penncozeb	mancozeb	Acramite	bifenazate

Table 1. Product formulations and their active ingredients (continued)

Product Name	Active ingredient	Product Name	Active ingredient	Product Name	Active ingredient
Actara*†	thiamethoxam	Endigo*†	thiamethoxam + lambda-	Perlan	benzyladenine +
Activator90	polyethoxylated		cyhalothrin		gibberellins
	nonylphenol (N-90)	Entrust SC§	spinosad	Phase	organosilicone surfactant
Admire Pro*	imidacloprid	Envidor*†	spirodiclofen	Platinum 75 SG*†	thiamethoxam
Advise 4*	imidacloprid	Epi-Mek	abamectin	Portal	fenpyroximate
Agree WG§	Bacillus thuringiensis	Esteem	pyriproxyfen	Pounce 25 WP*	permethrin
Agri-Flex*†	abamectin +	Exirel*† (Dupont)	cyantraniliprole	Proclaim*	emamectin benzoate
Agri-Mek*	thiamethoxam	Falgro Fanfare*	gibberellic acid bifenthrin	Pro-Gibb ProGibb 4%	gibberellic acid
Altacor*†	abamectin chlorantraniliprole	Fascination	benzyladenine +	Promalin	gibberellic acid benzyladenine +
Ammo	cypermethrin	Fascillation	gibberellins	Promain	gibberellins
Annihilate*	methomyl	Flagship*†	thiamethoxam	Provide 10% SG	gibberellic acid
Apistan	tau-fluvalinate	Flonicamid 50WG	flonicamid	Provoke*	imidacloprid
Apollo	clofentezine	Floramite	bifenazate	Pure Spray§	horticultural oil
Applaud IGR	buprofezin	Fyfanon	malathion	Pybuthrin	piperonyl butoxide
Aquaflow	tau-fluvalinate	GameStop§	kaolin	Pycana	pyrethrin
Arvida	acetamiprid	Gaucho 480	imidacloprid	PyGanic§	pyrethrin
Asana XL*	esfenvalerate	Gaucho 600	imidacloprid	Pyrenone	pyrethrin
Assail	acetamiprid	Gaucho XT	imidacloprid	Radiant SC	spinetoram
Avaunt	indoxacarb	GibGro	gibberellic acid	Regent	fipronil
Aza-Direct§	azadirachtin	Gladiator*	zeta-cypermethrin +	Regulaid	non-ionic surfactant
AzaGuard§	azadirachtin		avermectin	Return*†	oxamyl
Azatin§	azadirachtin	Gnatrol§	Bacillus thuringiensis	Rimon*	novaluron
Azomar	acetamiprid		subspecies and proteins	Safer§	Bacillus thuringiensis
Banter	bifenazate	Hero*	bifenthrin + piperonyl		subspecies and proteins
Baythroid XL*	beta-cyfluthrin		butoxide	Safer§	insecticidal soap
Baythroid*	cyfluthrin	Imidan*	phosmet	Savey	hexythiazox
Beleaf products	flonicamid	Induce	non-ionic surfactant	Seduce Insect Bait§	spinosad
Belt SC*†	Flubendiamide	Intrepid*†	methoxyfenozide	Serenade	Bacillus subtillis
Besiege*†	chlorantraniliprole +	IntruderMax	acetamiprid	Sevin	carbaryl
	lambda-cyhalothrin	Javelin§	Bacillus thuringiensis	ShuttleO	acequinocyl
Bifenture*	bifenthrin	INAC Challent	subspecies and proteins	Silencer*	lambda-cyhalothrin
BioBit§	Bacillus thuringiensis	JMS Stylet§	horticultural oil	Silicone	organosilicone surfactant
	subspecies and proteins	Justice	acetamiprid	Silkin	organosilicone surfactant
Bonideoil§	horticultural oil	Kanemite	acequinocyl	Silt	organosilicone surfactant
Brigade 10WSB*	bifenthrin	Kopa§	insecticidal soap	SpinTor 2SC§	spinosad
Brigade 2EC*	bifenthrin	Lannate products* Leverage 360*	methomyl beta-cyfluthrin +	Spirotetramat 240SC*	spirotetramat
Buprofezin 65% WP	buprofezin	Leverage 500	imidacloprid	Steward	indoxacarb
Butacide	piperonyl butoxide thiacloprid	Leverage 2.7*	cyfluthrin +	Subtilex NG	Bacillus subtillis
Calypso 4 Flowable*†	thaclopha	Leveluge 2.7	imidacloprid*	SuffOil-X§	horticultural oil
Carbaryl 4L	carbaryl	Leverage products	imidacloprid	Sultrus*	beta-cyfluthrin
Cease	Bacillus subtillis	LI-700	non-ionic surfactant	Sunspray	horticultural oil
Centaur*†	buprofezin	Lorsban*	chlorpyrifos	Supracide	methidathion
Collate*	ethephon	M1-LV*	methomyl	Surround 95 WP§	kaolin
Companion	Bacillus subtillis	Macho 2 & 4	imidacloprid	Talus 70DF*†	buprofezin
Confirm*†	tebufenozide	Magister	fenazaquin	Thuricide§	Bacillus thuringiensis
Corrida 29SL*	methomyl	Magus	fenazaquin	-	subspecies and proteins
Counter Lock-n-	terbufos	Mavrik	<i>tau</i> -fluvalinate	Tombstone*	cyfluthrin
Load*		Molt-X§	azadirachtin	Tourismo*†	flubendiamide
Counter 15G	terbufos	Movento*	spirotetramat	Triact 70§	azadirachtin
Smartbox*		M-pede§	insecticidal soap	Trilogy§	azadirachtin
Crossfire	polyethoxylated	Mustang &	piperonyl butoxide & zeta-	Tundra*	bifenthrin
	nonylphenol (N-90)	Mustang MAXX*	cypermethrin	Туру	benzyladenine +
Damoil	horticultural oil	N-90	polyethoxylated		gibberellins
Danitol*	fenpropathrin		nonylphenol (N-90)	Ultra-Fine	horticultural oil
Delegate WG	spinetoram	Nealta	cyflumetofen	Vendex*	fenbutatin-oxide
Demand SC, EZ & G	lambda-cyhalothrin	Neemix§	azadirachtin	Ventas*†	oxamyl
Des-X§	insecticidal soap	Nexter†	pyridaben	Verve*	ethephon
Diazinon*	diazinon	N-Large	gibberellic acid	Voliam Flexi*†	thiamethoxam +
Dimethoate*	dimethoate	Novagib	gibberellic acid		chlorantraniliprole
Dimilin*†	diflubenzuron	Nudrin*	methomyl	Warrior II Zeon*†∆	lambda-cyhalothrin
DiPel DF§	Bacillus thuringiensis	NuFarm Abamectin	abamectin	Xentari§	Bacillus thuringiensis
	subspecies and proteins	Omni	acetamiprid	700	subspecies and proteins
Drexel carbaryl	carbaryl	Onager Pedestal*	hexythiazox novaluron	Zeal ZetaGuard LBT	etoxazole zeta-cypermethrin + PBO
D			HOVALUTON	Zelaguaro I Ki	$_{2}$ era-cypermernrin + PBO
Durivo*†	thiamethoxam + chlorantraniliprole	Perimeter	tau-fluvalinate	Zoro	abamectin

Table 2. Pesticide synergies and acute, chronic, and sublethal toxicities forhoney bees and other pollinators

Key to table abbreviation, symbols, and colors

- Restricted-use pesticide

*

δ

- Not for use in Nassau and Suffolk counties of New York
- Meets USDA organic standards
- Identifies a chemical that at least one study has shown synergy with other active ingredients or products.
- Identifies a formulation containing more than one active ingredient, at least one of which has been shown to synergize with other chemicals

EPA standard toxicity ratings: acute oral and/or contact toxicity to the honey bee (Apis mellifera)

- Highly toxic (acute LD₅₀ < 2µg/bee)
- Moderately toxic (acute LD₅₀ 2 10.99µg/bee)
- Practically non-toxic (acute LD₅₀ >11 µg/bee)

Fungicides, antibiotics and inert ingredients

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
acibenzolar-S-methyl benzothiadiazole [P01]	Actigard				
azoxystrobin Qol-methoxy-acrylate fungicide [11]	Quadris F, Abound, Acadia, Aframe, Heritage			Ø	azoxystrobin (Quadris) synergizes with iprodione (2SE Select) ¹ . No synergy detected with thiacloprid ² .
azoxystrobin + difenoconazole Qol-methoxy-acrylate + DMI-triazole fungicide [11+3]	Quadris Top			×	See azoxystrobin and difenoconazole separately for synergy information.
azoxystrobin + flutriafol Qol-methoxy-acrylate + DMI-triazole fungicide [11+3]	TopguardEQ				
azoxystrobin + propiconazole Qol-methoxy-acrylate + DMI-triazole fungicides [11+3]	Quilt, Quilt Xcel			N.	See azoxystrobin and propiconazole separately for synergy information.

Active Ingredient	New York Trade Name	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee
Chemical group [Resistance code]	Examples	ισχιτιτγ	toxicity	non-toxic	species other than the honey bee
Bacillus amyloliquefaciens Microbial disruptor of pathogen produced by natural bacterium [44]	Double Nickel§, Ethos§, Monterey§, Revitalize§, Triathlon§, Vault§				
Bacillus subtilis Microbial disruptor of pathogen, toxin produced by natural bacterium [44]	Cease§, Kodiak§, Natria§, Serenade§, Sonata§, etc.				The wet application of <i>B. subtilis</i> strain QST713 (Serenade) reduced honey bee brood production and was highly toxic to the bumble bee (<i>Bombus terrestris</i>) ³ . Tests on the dry application of <i>B. subtilis</i> strain QST713 (Serenade) and strain QRD132 (Serenade) did not significantly impact <i>Bombus impatiens</i> ⁴ or honey bees ⁵ .
benzovindiflupyr SDHI-pyrazole-4-carboxamide fungicide [7]	Aprovia*, Elatus*, Mural*				A new product for bitterrot.
boscalid SDHI-pyridine-carboxamide fungicide [7]	Endura (grape)			@	Synergizes with clothianidin and thiamethoxam ⁶ .
boscalid + pyraclostrobin SDHI-pyridine-carboxamide + QoI- methoxy-carboxamide fungicides [7+11]	Coronet, Pristine			&	boscalid+pyraclostrobin (Pristine) synergizes with chlorpyrifos ⁷ reducing queen emergence, with iprodione (2SE Select) increasing honey bee mortality ¹ , and with iprodione (Rovral) negatively impacting solitary bee species nesting behavior ⁸ .
boscalid + pyraclostrobin + lambda-cyhalothrin SDHI-pyridine-carboxamide + QoI-methoxy-carboxamide fungicides + a pyrethroid insecticide [7+11+3A]	Bonide Fruit Tree and Plant Guard	®			See boscalid, pyraclostrobin and lambda-cyhalothrin separately for synergy information.
captan phthalimide fungicide [M4]	Captan 50 WP, Captan, 80 WDG, Captec 4L				Studies have found captan to increase honey bee brood mortality at a moderately toxic level ^{9,10} and alter larval feeding capacity ¹¹ . A study conducted by the USDA Bee Lab in Weslaco, TX found that the inert ingredients mixed with captan make it highly toxic ¹² . Other laboratory studies report captan to be highly toxic to mason bees ¹³ and leafcutter bees ^{14,15} but practically non-toxic to bumble bees at recommended field rates ¹⁶ .

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
<i>chlorothalonil</i> chloronitrile fungicide [M5]	Bravo ZN, Bravo Ultrex, Echo Products, Equus, Initiate			8	Synergizes with alpha-cypermethrin and lambda- cyhalothrin ¹⁷ and the beekeeping miticides <i>tau</i> - fluvalinate, coumaphos ^{18,19} , and Thymol ¹⁸ . Also synergizes with the thiophanate-methyl product Cerconil [®] . Chlorothalonil exhibits cumulative oral toxicity in honey bee larvae reared on field relevant doses for 6 days ¹⁹ and increases honey bee and bumble bee susceptibility to <i>Nosema</i> infection ^{20,21} & entombed pollen inside the honey bee hive ²⁰ .
copper hydroxide inorganic fungicide/bacteriacide [M1]	Kocide§, Champ§				
copper octanoate inorganic fungicide/bacteriacide [M1]	Camelot O§, Cueva§, Liquid copper Products§, Ortho Elements Garden§				
<i>copper oxychloride/</i> <i>copper hydroxide</i> <i>inorganic</i> <i>fungicide/bacteriacide</i> [M1]	Badge SC & X2§			@	copper oxychloride synergizes with imidacloprid ²² .
copper oxychloride/copper sulfate inorganic fungicide/bacteriacide [M1]	C.O.C.S.				copper oxychloride synergizes with imidacloprid ²² .
copper sulfate inorganic fungicide/bacteriacide [M1]	Bordeaux§, Cuprofix Ultra§, Cuproxat§, Mastercop§				Highly toxic to a stingless bee species via oral exposure ²³ .
cyprodinil anilino-pyrimidine fungicide, [9]	Vanguard WG			6	Moderate toxicity when it synergizes with thiacloprid ² .
difenoconazole DMI-triazole fungicide [3]	Quadris-Top, Amistar, etc.				Synergizes with deltamethrin ²⁴ and the <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate ²⁵ product MAVRIK inducing hypothermia in honey bees.
difenoconazole + fludioxonil DMI-triazole + phenylpyrroles fungicides [3+12]	Academy			×.	See difenoconazole and fludioxonil separately for synergy information.

Active Ingredient	New York	High	Moderate		Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee
Chemical group [Resistance code]	Trade Name Examples	toxicity	toxicity	non-toxic	species other than the honey bee
difenoconazole + cyprodinil DMI-triazole + anilino- pyrimidine fungicides [3+9]	Inspire Super			×.	See difenoconazole and cyprodinil separately for synergy information.
dodine guanidine fungicide [U12]	Syllit FL				
fenbuconazole DMI-triazole fungicide [3]	Indar 2F			&	Synergizes with <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate ¹⁸ making it highly toxic to honey bees. At a field relevant dose the fenbuconazole product, Indar 2F, synergizes with acetamiprid ²⁷ in a solitary bee, doubling the toxicity of acetamiprid, making it borderline highly toxic (LD ₅₀ 2.1).
fenhexamid SBI-KRI hydroxyanilide fungicide [17]	Decree, Elevate				
fenhexamid + captan SBI-KRI hydroxyanilides + phthalimide [17+M4]	CaptEvate				See captan separately for toxicity notes.
ferbam dithiocarbamate fungicide [M3]	Ferbam granuflo				
fludioxonil phenylpyrroles fungicide [12]	Cannonball, Scholar				Impacts honey bee learning behavior ²⁸ .
<i>fluopicolide</i> acylpicolide fungicide [U]	Presidio* for landscape fruit trees				
fluopyram pyridinyl-ethyl-benzamide fungicide [7]	Velum Prime*†, Broadform*†				
fluopyram + pyrimethanil Pyridinyl-ethyl-benzamide + anilino-pyrimidine fungicides [7+9]	Luna Tranquility*†				
flutriafol DMI-triazole fungicide [3]	Rhyme†			8	Synergizes with lambda-cyhalothrin ^{29,30} making lambda- cyhalothring 3 times more toxic. Although EPA classifies this pesticide as low toxicity to honey bees, the European Food Safety Authority has determined it exhibits moderate toxicity when the a.i. is consumed by bees ³¹ .

Active Ingredient	New York	High	Moderate	Practically	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee
Chemical group	Trade Name	toxicity	toxicity	non-toxic	species other than the honey bee
[Resistance code]	Examples				
fluxapyroxad + pyraclostrobin SDHI-pyrazole-4-carboxamide + methoxy-carboxamide fungicides [7+11]	Merivon Xemium*†			¥	See pyraclostrobin separately for synergy information.
fosetyl-Al Aluminum tris (O- ethylphosphonate) fungicide [P07(33)]	Aliette WDG				
imazalil DMI-imidazole fungicide [3]	Fungaflor, Freshgard, Fungazil				Synergizes with cypermethrin, fipronil, and thiamethoxam in bumble bees ³² and lambda-cyhalothrin in honey bees ³⁰ .
iprodione dicarboxamide fungicide [2]	Meteor*, 26GT*, Nevado*, Rovral 4 F*, Iprodione 2F Select*			8	Synergizes with the product Pristine (pyraclostrobin+boscalid) ⁸ . A product formulation, Compass SC (iprodione + thiophanate methyl), was found to synergize with the varroacide, Mavrik (<i>tau</i> - fluvalinate) ³³ and decrease the repellency of honey bees to cypermethrin ¹⁷ thereby increasing their exposure. One study reports high toxicity to honey bee larvae ¹⁰ and another study reports sublethal effects on some solitary bees ⁸ .
kasugamycin antibiotic [24]	Kasumin 2L				
<i>kresoxim-methyl</i> Qol-oximino-acetate fungicide [11]	Sovran*†				
<i>mandipropamid + difenoconazole</i> CAA mandelic acid amides + DMI- triazole fungicides [40+3]	Revus Top			@	See difenoconazole separately for synergy information.
mancozeb dithiocarbamate fungicide [M3]	Dithane*, Koverall*, Manzate, Penncozeb*			8	When combined with alpha-cypermethrin or lambda- cyhalothrin studies found a 2-4 fold decrease in the contact toxicities ¹⁷ of these two insecticides. Synergy not detected with thiacloprid ² .
mancozeb + copper hydroxide dithiocarbamate fungicide + inorganic fungicide/bactericide [M3+M1]	ManKocide*			¥	See mancozeb separately for synergy information.

Active Ingredient	New York	High	Moderate	Practically	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee
Chemical group [Resistance code]	Trade Name Examples	toxicity	toxicity	non-toxic	species other than the honey bee
mefenoxam (metalaxyl-M) phenylamide acylalanine insect growth regulator [4]	Quali-Pro Mefenoxam, Ultra Flourish				
metconazole DMI- triazole[3]	Quash, Tourney				Synergy with <i>Tau</i> -fluvalinate ¹⁸ causing a 3-4 fold increase in contact toxicity of this miticide.
metiram dithiocarbamate fungicide [M3]	Polyram 80DF				
<i>metrafenone</i> benzophenone fungicide [50]	Vivando				
myclobutanil DMI-triazole fungicide [3]	Rally 40 WSP, Sonoma 20 EW AG, Sonoma 40 WSP			@	Synergizes with clothianidin, imidacloprid, thiamethoxam ³⁴ , lambda-cyahalothrin ^{30,35} , <i>Tau</i> - fluvalinate ¹⁸ via oral and/or contact exposure in honey bees. Synergy with lambda-cyhalothrin also affects bumble bees feeding on pollen ³⁵ . Synergy is not detected with thiacloprid ³⁴ .
mineral oil Horticultural Spray	Biocover, BVA, Damoil, Civitas Turf, Glacial Spray, PureSpray, Omni				
N-methyl-2-pyrrolidone (NMP) inert ingredient often used in pesticide formulations as a co- solvent	NMP is in abamectin 0.15EC, Ardent 0.15, Exilis plus, Temprano, Zoro				This inert ingredient is highly toxic to honey bee larvae ¹⁹ .
<i>oxytetracycline</i> tetracycline antibiotic	Fireline, MycoShield				One study found a synergy with <i>Tau</i> -fluvlinate ³⁶ while another study did not show synergy with <i>tau</i> - fluvalinate ¹⁸ .
penthiopyrad pyrazole-4-carboxamide fungicide [7]	Fontelis				
piperonyl butoxide synergist	Exponent, PBO-8, and various pyrethrum products			@	Synergizes with acetamiprid ³⁷ , coumaphos ^{38,18} , Cyfluthrin ³⁹ , fenpyroximate ¹⁸ , lambda cyhalothrin ^{29,39} , permethrin ⁴⁰ , <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate ^{38,18} , and thiacloprid ³⁷ as well as imidacloprid and the product Advise ^{37,41} .

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
potassium bicarbonate Inorganic salt	Agricure, Kaligreen, MilStop				
propiconazole DMI-triazole fungicide [3]	Alamo*, Alsa*, Propi Max, Bumper 250EC*, Cherokee, Kestrel Mex*, Menara, Marazo, Tilt, Mantis, Banner Maxx			@	Synergizes with alpha-cypermethrin ³⁰ , acetamiprid, imidacloprid, thiacloprid ^{37,34} , lambda cyhalothrin ^{30,17} , <i>Tau</i> -fluvalinate ¹⁸ , and thiamethoxam ³⁴ in honey bees. One study determined that propiconazole reduced the toxicity of thiacloprid ³⁴ . Synergizes with clothianidin in honey bees, bumble bees and some solitary bees ⁴² however another study demonstrated only additive effects of clothianidin ⁴³ . propiconazole alone decreases bumble bee reproduction ⁴⁴ .
pyraclostrobin Qol-methoxy-carboxamide fungicide [11]	Crystalline BASF* products, Cabrio EG, Empress Intrinsic			8	Synergizes with fenpyroximate and the beekeeping miticide <i>Tau</i> -fluvalinate ¹⁸ . The pyraclostrobin+boscalid product Pristine synergizes with iprodione (2SE Select) ¹ and negatively impacts nesting success of some solitary bees ⁸ and reproductive success ⁴⁵ and immunity in honey bees ⁷ . When combined with fipronil honey bee larval feeding decreases ⁴⁶ .
pyrimethanil anilino-pyrimidine fungicide [9]	Decco Pyr. 400 SC, Scala, Penbotec 400 SC, EFOG-160				
quinoxyfen azanaphthalene aryloxyquinoline fungicide [13]	Quintec				
reynoutria Botanical extract of <i>Reynoutria sacchalinensis</i>	Regalia				
streptomycin antibiotic [25]	Agri-mycin*, Streptrol, Firewall				
sulfur Inorganic natural element [M2]	Sulfur, Some products §				Moderate oral toxicity can remain up to 7 days ⁴⁷ .
<i>thiophanate-methyl</i> <i>thiophanate fungicide</i> [1]	Topsin M, Incognito 4.5F			8	Synergizes with <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate ^{17,18} , flumethrin, and lambda-cyhalothrin ¹⁷ becoming highly toxic to honey bees. Synergizes with product formulations containing the single active ingredients imidacloprid, deltamethrin and chlorothalonil ⁴⁸ to become highly toxic to honey bees and other bees when consumed.

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
trifloxystrobin methoxy-carboxamide fungicide [11]	Flint, Flint Extra, Gem 500SC,				
triflumizole imidazole fungicide [3]	Procure*, Terraguard*				Synergizes with acetamiprid, imidacloprid, and thiacloprid ³⁷ .
ziram dithio-carbamate fungicide [M3]	Ziram				Larval mortality in laboratory studies ¹⁰ .

Mixtures of fungicides and insecticides

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
boscalid + pyraclostrobin + lambda-cyhalothrin SDHI-pyridine-carboxamide + QoI-methoxy-carboxamide fungicides + a pyrethroid insecticide [7+11+3A]	Bonide Fruit Tree and Plant Guard	8		See boscalid, pyraclostrobin and lambda-cyhalothrin separately for synergy information.

Insecticides (including insect growth regulators) and adjuvants

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
<i>abamectin /avermectin</i> avermectin insecticide [6]	Agri-Mek*, Abamex, Epi- Mek*, NuFarm abamectin*, Zoro*	8			The abamectin formulation (Vertimec [®]) which includes unknown inert ingredients produces a synergistic response that was 709 times/1870 times more toxic to honey bees/Melipona bees than the active ingredient, abamectin alone ⁴⁹ . Highly toxic both topically and orally to honey bees ⁵⁰ and arrests reproduction in bumble bees ⁵¹ . Other non-honey bee species exhibits moderate to high toxicity via contact and oral exposure, respectively ⁵² .
<i>abamectin +</i> <i>thiamethoxam</i> avermectin + nitro-neonicotinoid insecticide [6+4A]	Agri-Flex*†	*			See abamectin separately for toxicity information and thiamethoxam separately for synergy information.
<i>acequinocyl</i> quinolone insecticide [20B]	Kanemite, Shuttle O				Topical and oral exposure arrests bumble bee reproduction ⁵¹ .

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
<i>acetamiprid</i> cyano-neonicotinoid insecticide [4A]	Assail, Arvida, Azomar, Justice, Omni, Intruder Max,		®		Synergizes with piperonyl butoxide (PBO), S,S,S- tributylphosphorotrithioate (DEF), triflumizole ³⁷ , propiconazole ^{37,35} , and the fenbuconazole product (Indar2) ²⁷ making these highly toxic mixtures. Synergy with propiconazole ³⁵ and fenbuconazole (Indar2) ²⁷ is also present in bumble bees and mason bees respectively.
<i>azadirachtin</i> Naturally occurring tetranortriterpenoid Insect growth regulator [UN]	Aza-Direct§, AzaGuard§, Molt-X§, Neemix§, Azatin§, Triact 70§, Trilogy§				Oral exposure at field relevant dose causes honey bee larval mortality and sublethal effects on adult body size ^{53–55} . Oral exposure below, at, and above a field relevant does causes bumble bee worker mortality and sublethal effects on reproduction and body mass ⁵⁶ .
Bacillus subtillis Microbial disruptor of insect midgut membranes [11A]	Cease, Companion, Serenade (Max, Opti, ASO, Soil), Subtilex NG				<i>B. subtilis</i> is toxic to bumble bee species (<i>B. terrestris</i>) ³ and exhibits sublethal effects on reproduction in <i>Bombus impatiens</i> ⁴ .
Bacillus thuringiensis subspecies and proteins Microbial disruptor of insect midgut membranes [11A]	BioBit§, DiPel DF§, Gnatrol§, Javelin§, Monterey§, Safer§, Thuricide§, Xentari§				Negative sublethal impacts on honey bee physiology ⁵⁷ .
benzyladenine + gibberellins Insect growth regulators	Perlan, Promalin, Fascination				
beta-Cyfluthrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Baythroid XL*, Sultrus*, Tempo SC*	®			The parent chemical, cyfluthrin synergizes with piperonyl butoxide ³⁹ becoming 30 times more toxic to honey bees. It also impacts honey bee behavior ³⁹ and is highly toxic topically and orally to bumble bees ^{35,58}
beta-Cyfluthrin + imidacloprid pyrethroid + cyano- neonicotinoid insecticide [3A+4A]	Leverage 360*	*			See cyfluthrin and imidacloprid separately for synergy and toxicity information.
bifenazate Insect growth regulator [20D]	Acramite, Banter, Floramite				Moderate and High toxicity, topically and orally, relatively to bumble bees including sublethal effects at just $1/_{10} - 1/_2$ MFRC ⁵¹ . Honey bee mortality increased 5 times, 10 days after exposure ⁵⁹ .

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
bifenthrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Aceto*†, Bifenture*, Brigade WSB*†, Brigade EC*†, Fanfare*, Tundra EC*	®			Synergizes with the miticide Apistan (Tau-fluvalinate) ⁶⁰ . Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{60,35} however typically bifenthrin residue not frequently found in pollen and nectar ³⁵ .
<i>bifenthrin + zeta-</i> <i>cypermethrin w/ piperonyl</i> <i>butoxide</i> <i>pyrethroid insecticide +</i> <i>synergist [3A+synergist]</i>	Hero*	B			See bifenthrin, zeta-cypermethrin and piperonyl butoxide separately for other synergy information. Piperonyl butoxide is a well known synergist with pyrethroids like bifenthrin. Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{60,35} .
buprofezin Insect growth regulator [16]	Applaud IGR*†, buprofezin 65% WP*†, Centaur*†,				The product formulation <i>buprofezin 65% WP</i> exhibits moderate toxicity ⁴⁹ .
carbaryl carbamate insecticide [1A]	Sevin Carbaryl, Drexel Carbaryl, Carbaryl 4L				Toxic to bee species other than the honey bee ⁶¹ . Used as a thinner at petal fall it impacts the bee community that typically are still visiting petal-less flowers.
<i>chlorantraniliprole</i> anthranilic diamide insecticide [28]	Altacor*†				Suppresses reproduction in worker bumble bees ⁶² . Synergy not detected with propiconazole in honey bees ⁶³ .
chlorantraniliprole + lambda-cyhalothrin anthranilic diamide + pyrethroid insecticide [28+3A]	Besiege*†	*			See chlorantraniliprole and lambda-cyhalothrin separately for synergy and toxicity information.
<i>chlorpyrifos</i> organophosphate insecticide [1B]	Lorsban*	®			Synergizes with propiconazole ⁶⁴ doubling the toxicity. When combined with the product formulation Pristine (pyraclostrobin + boscalid) it reduces honey bee queen emergence ⁷ . Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{65,66,35} , solitary bees ⁵² and chronically lethal to honey bee larvae ¹⁹ .
<i>chlorpyrifos + bifenthrin</i> organophosphate + pyrethroid insecticide [1B+3A]	Tundra Supreme*†	8			See bifenthrin and chlorpyrifos separately for synergy information.
<i>clofentezine</i> tetrazine ovicide/miticide, an insect growth inhibitor [10A]	Apollo				
cyantraniliprole anthranilic diamide insecticide [28]	Dupont Exirel*†				

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
cyflumetofen beta-ketonitrile miticide [25A]	Nealta				
cyfluthrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Baythroid*, Tombstone*	®			Synergizes with piperonyl butoxide ³⁹ becoming 30 times more toxic to honey bees. It also impacts honey bee behavior ³⁹ and is highly toxic topically and orally to bumble bees ^{35,58}
cyfluthrin + imidacloprid* pyrethroid + nitro- neonicotinoid insecticide [3A+4A]	Leverage2.7*, Leverage 360*	*			See cyfluthrin and imidacloprid separately for synergy information.
cypermethrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Ammo, Fastac	89			Synergizes with imazalil in at least one bumble bee species ³² . <i>Alpha</i> -cypermethrin, an isomer of cypermethrin, synergizes with chlorothalonil (Bravo SC [®] , 500g/l), propiconazole (Tilt EC, 250g/l), and prochloraz (Sportak EW [®] , 450 g/l), and increases toxicity of carbendazim (Derosal WG [®] 80%), iprodione + thiophanate methyl (Compass SC [®] 15.5%/15.5%) and other triazoles including Tebuconazole (Folicur EW [®] , 250 g/l) and difenoconazole (Plover EC [®] , 250 g/l). Both cypermethrin and Zeta-cypermethrin are highly toxic to solitary bees ⁶⁷ . cypermethrin increases Chronic Paralysis Virus (CPV) infection ⁶⁸ .
diazinon organophosphate insecticide [1B]	Diazinon*				Highly toxic to bumble bees and some solitary bees as well as honey bees ^{69,61} .
<i>diflubenzuron</i> Insect growth regulator [7C]	Dimilin*†				Has shown sublethal effects on larvae and fertility of adult honey bees ^{70–75} ; but see ⁷⁶ .
<i>dimethoate</i> organophosphate insecticide [1B]	Drexel Dimethoate*				Highly toxic to bumble bees and some solitary bees ^{77,13} .
emamectin benzoate avermectin insecticide [6]	Proclaim*∆				
esfenvalerate pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Asana XL*				Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{52,35} and exhibits sublethal effects on megachilid bees ⁷⁸ .
ethephon Insect growth regulator	Collate*, Verve*				
<i>etoxazole</i> etoxazole insecticide [10B]	Zeal				Highly toxic to bumble bees when consumed ^{51,57} .
fenazaquin pyridazine insecticide [21A]	Magister, Magus				Low toxicity to bumble bees ⁵⁸

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
Fenbutatin-oxide organotin insecticide [12B]	Vendex*				
fenoxycarb (EXPIRED) Insect growth regulator [7B]					Reduces reproduction and the size of winter honey bee colonies ⁷⁴ .
fenpropathrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Danitol 2.4*†				Highly toxic to bumble bees and some solitary bees ⁷⁹ .
fenpyroximate pyridazine insecticide [21A]	Portal			&	Synergizes with enzyme inhibitors piperonyl butoxide (PBO) and S,S,S-tributylphosphorotrithioate (DEF), fungicides including prochloraz, pyraclostrobin and beekeeping miticides amitraz ¹⁸ , and Oxalic acid making these mixes highly toxic. And in the cases of the beekeeping miticides <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate and coumaphos ¹⁸ borderline high toxicity (LD ₅₀ 2.04-2.4). Although EPA has reported that this active ingredient is practically non- toxic, one study measured moderate toxicity to honey bees ¹⁸ .
fipronil phenylpyrazoles [2B]	Regent				Synergizes with imazalil to be lethal to bumble bees at 24 hrs but the toxicity subsides by 48 hrs ³² . fipronil is associated with increased <i>Nosema</i> infection ⁸⁰
flonicamid flonicamid insecticide [29]	Beleaf 50SG, Flonicamid 50WG				
<i>flubendiamide</i> anthranilic diamide insecticide [28]	Belt SC*†, Tourismo*†				Moderate toxicity when applied topically to honey bees has been reported in laboratory and semi-field conditions ⁸¹ . <i>Megachile rotundata</i> ⁸² and <i>Bombus</i> <i>impatiens</i> ⁸³ were not impacted by the flubendiamide product formulation, Belt SC [®] .
gibberellic acid Insect growth regulator	Falgro, Novagib, GibGro, N- Large, Pro- Gibb 4%§, Pro-Vide 10%SG				Also used as a supplement in the honey bee diet ⁸⁴ .
hexythiazox thiazolidine insecticide [10A]	Hexygon, Savey, Onager				
horticultural oil	Damoil, PureSpray§, Sunspray, JMS Stylet§, SuffOil-X§, Ultra-Fine, Bonide oil§				Products with Thymol, Menthol, and Rosemary can be highly toxic, especially when bees are already stressed ^{85– ⁸⁸). Bees are temporarily inactivated by direct contact with oil sprays; death may occur⁸⁹.}

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
<i>imidacloprid</i> neonicotinoid insecticide [4A]	Advise 4*, Admire Pro Protectant*, Leverage products, Macho 2* & 4*, Provoke*	®			Synergizes with piperonyl butoxide ^{37,41} , propiconazole ³⁷ , triflumizole ³⁷ , The imidacloprid product Advise 2FL [®] synergized with Vydate 3.77 CLV [®] (oxamyl), Transform 5G [®] (Sulfloxaflor), and Domark ME [®] (Tetraconazole) ⁴¹ . Highly toxic to bumble bees ⁹⁰ . May impact groundnesting bees in general ⁹¹ .
<i>indoxacarb</i> oxadiazine insecticide [22A]	Avaunt				High toxicity even at field-realistic doses ^{81,92} .
insecticidal Soap Repellant	M-pede§, Des-X§, Kopa§, Safer§				
kaolin Repellant	Surround WP§				
<i>lambda-cyhalothrin</i> pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Demand SC* & EZ* & G*, Silencer*, Warrior II with Zeon*	S			Synergizes with flutriafol ²⁹ , imazalil, myclobutanil, propiconazole ³⁰ , prochloraz ^{29,30,93} , and piperonyl butoxide ^{29,39} making them 16x. Highly toxic to bumble bees ⁷⁹ and some solitary bees ^{79,94} .
malathion organosphosphate insecticide [1B]	Fyfanon				Highly toxic to bumble bees and some solitary bees ⁹⁵ .
<i>methidathion</i> organosphosphate insecticide [1B]	Supracide				Realistic field exposure moderately toxic ³⁵ .
methomyl carbamate insecticide [1A]	Annihilate*, Corrida 29SL*, Lannate*, Lannate LV, M1-LV*, Nudrin*				Moderately to Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{96,58} .
methoxyfenozide diacylhydrazine insecticide [18] an insect growth regulator	Intrepid*†				Acute and chronic effects to honey bee larvae and adults over time ⁵⁹ .
non-ionic surfactant	Regulaid, LI-700, Induce				
novaluron benzoylureas insecticide [15]	Pedestal*, Rimon*				Sublethal impacts on egg and larvae of honey bees ⁹⁷ , some bumble bees ^{91,98} and leafcutter bees ^{91,99} .

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
organosilicone surfactant adjuvant	Phase, Silt, Silkin, Silicone				Increases susceptibility of bees to disease, resulting in exponentially increased mortality ^{70,100} .
oxamyl carbamate insecticide [1A]	Return*†, Ventas*†	8			The oxamyl product Vydate 3.7CLV [®] synergizes with imidacloprid product (Advise2FL [®]) ⁴¹ . No effects on bumble bees ⁵⁷ .
permethrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Pounce 25 WP*	8			Synergizes with piperonyl butoxide ⁴⁰ . Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{79,101} and solitary bees ^{79,102} .
phosmet organophosphate insecticide [1B]	Imidan*				Highly toxic to some solitary bees ⁷⁹ . Often high residues in pollen samples ³⁵ .
piperonyl butoxide (PBO) synergist	Ingredient in Mustang MAXX*, Butacide, Pybuthrin, and Ambush			8	Synergizes with acetamiprid ³⁷ , coumaphos ¹⁸ , cyfluthrin ³⁹ , fenpyroximate ¹⁸ , lambda cyhalothrin ^{29,93} , permethrin ^{40,29,38} , prochloraz ^{29,93} , <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate ^{18,39} , and thiacloprid ³⁷ making highly or more highly toxic including coumaphos ¹⁸ which became moderately toxic with PBO. While PBO synergizes with imidacloprid to be just 1.7x more toxic, its combination with the <i>imidacloprid product</i> Advise [®] increased toxicity 5.2 - fold ⁴¹ .
polyethoxylated Nonylphenol (N-90) adjuvant	N-90, Activator 90, Crossfire				Sublethal effects on behavior of the honey bee in response to the product Activator-90 ⁷⁰ as well as to managed solitary bee species when used alone and in the case of Grow-More [®] N-90, in combination with Rovral 4F [®] (iprodione) and Pristine [®] (pyraclostrobin + boscalid) which ultimately decreases reproductive output ⁸ .
pyrethrin pyrethrin insecticide [3A]	PyGanic§, Pycana, Pyrenone	*			Synthetic forms synergize with multiple pesticide ingredients. See pyrethroids. Some formulations found to decrease honey bee body temperature ¹⁰³ .
pyridaben pyridazine insecticide [21A]	Nexter†				
pyriproxyfen Insect growth regulator [7C]	Esteem				Exhibits sublethal impacts on honey bee larvae, adult behavior, and survival ^{59,104} as well as bumble bee larvae ¹⁰⁵ .
spinetoram spynosin insecticide [5]	Delegate WG, Radiant SC				
spinosad spynosin insecticide [5]	Entrust SC§, Seduce§, SpinTor 2SC§, Conserve SC Turf Ornamental				Moderate contact and high oral acute toxicity to bumble bees ^{106,91} as well as sublethal foraging effects ¹⁰⁷ on bumble bees. One non- <i>Apis</i> bee species experienced moderate contact toxicity ⁹¹ while three other species experienced high contact toxicity ^{91,108,23} .

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity	Moderate toxicity	Practically non-toxic	Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
spirodiclofen tetronic acid insecticide [23]	Envidor*†				Although EPA classifies spirodiclofen as low toxicity, one study finds moderate toxicity to adult honey bees ¹⁰⁹ . Chronic exposure significantly reduced honey bee ¹¹⁰ and bumble bee reproduction and colony strength ⁵¹ .
<i>spirotetramat</i> tetramic acid insecticide [23]	Movento*, Spirotetramat 240 SC*				Moderate acute toxicity and High chronic oral toxicity and sublethal reproductive effects to bumble bees ^{111,4} . Moderately toxic to honey bee larvae in laboratory studies with does above field recommendations ¹¹² .
tau-fluvalinate (beekeeping) pyrethroid insecticide [3A] a beekeeping miticide.	Apistan, Aquaflow, Perimeter, Mavrik	89			Synergizes with boscalid ¹⁸ , chlorothalonil ^{19,18} , fenbuconazole, metconazole, myclobutanil, prochloraz, propiconazole ¹⁸ , piperonyl butoxide ^{39,18} as well as beekeeping miticides coumaphos ^{38,18} , Thymol, amitraz, fenpyroximate, and oxalic acid ¹⁸ . Highly toxic to honey bee larvae ¹⁹ . One study on the <i>tau</i> -fluvalinate product Mavrik [®] and the difenoconazole+carbendazim product ERIA [®] resulted in no lethal nor sublethal effects on bees ²⁵ .
tebufenozide Insect growth regulator[7c]	Confirm*†				Exhibits sublethal effects on honey bee behavior and learning ^{73,70} .
thiacloprid *This product is suspended, please dispose. cyano-neonicotinoid insecticide [4A]	Calypso 4 Flowable*†			@	Synergizes with cyprodinil ² , piperonyl butoxide ³⁷ , triflumizole and propiconazole ^{39,noted in 29} and is associated with increased <i>Nosema</i> infection in honey bees ⁸⁰ . However one study found no synergy when mixed with tebuconazole, propiconazole or myclobutanil ³⁴ . Field relevant exposure is lethal to bumble bee colonies ¹¹³ .
thiamethoxam nitro-neonicotinoid insecticide [4A]	Actara*†, Flagship*†, Platinum 75 SG*†, Cruiser FS	89			Synergizes with boscalid ⁶ , propiconazole ^{33,34} , myclobutanil ³⁴ , and tebuconazole ³⁴ . Synergizes with imazalil in both honey bees and bumble bees ³² . Highly toxic to bumble bees ^{114,115} and some solitary bees ¹¹⁶ . Synergistic effect on honeybee mortality when co- exposed to thiamethoxam and Chronic Bee Paralysis Virus ¹¹⁷ .
thiamethoxam + fludioxonil + mefenoxam	Adage ST, Cruiser MAXX				
thiamethoxam + chlorantraniliprole nitro-neonicotinoid + anthranilic diamide insecticide [4A+28]	Voliam Flexi*†, Durivo*†	®			See thiamethoxam and chlorantraniliprole separately for synergy and toxicity information.
thiamethoxam + lambda-cyhalothrin nitro-neonicotinoid + pyrethroid insecticide [4A+3A]	Endigo*†	S			See thiamethoxam and lambda-cyhalothrin separately for synergy information.

Active Ingredient Chemical group [Resistance code]	New York Trade Name Examples	High toxicity		Synergies, sublethal effects, and toxicity to bee species other than the honey bee
zeta-cypermethrin pyrethroid insecticide [3A]	Mustang MAXX*			See cypermethrin separately for synergy information. Z <i>eta</i> -cypermethrin is highly toxic to solitary bees ⁶⁷ .
zeta-cypermethrin + avermectin pyrethroid + avermectin insecticides [3+6]	Gladiator*	8		See (<i>zeta</i>)-cypermethrin and avermectin separately for synergy and toxicity information.



Literature Cited

- Fisher, A., Coleman, C., Hoffmann, C., Fritz, B. & Rangel, J. The synergistic effects of almond protection fungicides on honey bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae) forager survival. *J Econ Entomol* **110**, 802– 808 (2017).
- Schmuck, R., Stadler, T. & Schmidt, H.-W. Field relevance of a synergistic effect observed in the laboratory between an EBI fungicide and a chloronicotinyl insecticide in the honeybee (Apis mellifera L, Hymenoptera). *Pest Management Science: formerly Pesticide Science* 59, 279–286 (2003).
- Mommaerts, V., Sterk, G., Hoffmann, L. & Smagghe, G. A laboratory evaluation to determine the compatibility of microbiological control agents with the pollinator Bombus terrestris. *Pest Management Science: formerly Pesticide Science* 65, 949–955 (2009).
- Ramanaidu, K. & Cutler, G. C. Different toxic and hormetic responses of *Bombus impatiens* to *Beauveria bassiana*, *Bacillus subtilis* and spirotetramat. *Pest management science* 69, 949–954 (2013).
- Dedej, S., Delaplane, K. S. & Scherm, H. Effectiveness of honey bees in delivering the biocontrol agent *Bacillus subtilis* to blueberry flowers to suppress mummy berry disease. *Biological Control* **31**, 422–427 (2004).
- 6. Tsvetkov, N. *et al.* Chronic exposure to neonicotinoids reduces honey bee health near corn crops. *Science* **356**, 1395–1397 (2017).
- DeGrandi-Hoffman, G., Chen, Y. & Simonds, R. The effects of pesticides on queen rearing and virus titers in honey bees (*Apis mellifera L.*). *Insects* 4, 71–89 (2013).
- Artz, D. R. & Pitts-Singer, T. L. Effects of fungicide and adjuvant sprays on nesting behavior in two managed solitary bees, *Osmia lignaria* and *Megachile rotundata*. *PLoS One* **10**, e0135688 (2015).

- 9. Atkins, E. L. & Kellum, D. Comparative morphogenic and toxicity studies on the effect of pesticides on honeybee brood. *Journal of Apicultural Research* **25**, 242–255 (1986).
- Mussen, E. C., Lopez, J. E. & Peng, C. Y. S. Effects of selected fungicides on growth and development of larval honey bees, *Apis mellifera* L. (Hymenoptera: Apidae). *Environmental Entomology* 33, 1151–1154 (2004).
- 11. Heylen, K., Gobin, B., Arckens, L., Huybrechts, R. & Billen, J. The effects of four crop protection products on the morphology and ultrastructure of the hypopharyngeal gland of the European honeybee, Apis mellifera. *Apidologie* **42**, 103–116 (2011).
- Everich, R., Schiller, C., Whitehead, J., Beavers, M. & Barrett, K. Effects of captan on *Apis mellifera* brood development under field conditions in California almond orchards. *J Econ Entomol* **102**, 20–29 (2009).
- Ladurner, E., Bosch, J., Kemp, W. P. & Maini, S. Assessing delayed and acute toxicity of five formulated fungicides to *Osmia lignaria* Say and Apis mellifera. *Apidologie* 36, 449–460 (2005).
- 14. Huntzinger, C. I., James, R. R., Bosch, J. & Kemp, W. P. Laboratory bioassays to evaluate fungicides for chalkbrood control in larvae of the alfalfa leafcutting bee (Hymenoptera: Megachilidae). *Journal of economic entomology* **101**, 660–667 (2008).
- Huntzinger, C. I., James, R. R., Bosch, J. & Kemp, W. P. Fungicide tests on adult alfalfa leafcutting bees (Hymenoptera: Megachilidae). *Journal of economic entomology* **101**, 1088–1094 (2008).
- Malone, L. A., Scott-Dupree, C. D., Todd, J. H. & Ramankutty, P. No sub-lethal toxicity to bumblebees, *Bombus terrestris*, exposed to Btcorn pollen, captan and novaluron. *New Zealand Journal of Crop and Horticultural Science* 35, 435–439 (2007).

- Thompson, H. & Wilkins, S. Assessment of the synergy and repellency of pyrethroid/fungicide mixtures. *B Insectol* 56, 131–134 (2003).
- Johnson, R. M., Dahlgren, L., Siegfried, B. D. & Ellis, M. D. Acaricide, fungicide and drug interactions in honey Bees (*Apis mellifera*). *PLoS One* 8, (2013).
- Zhu, W., Schmehl, D. R., Mullin, C. A. & Frazier, J. L. Four common pesticides, their mixtures and a formulation solvent in the hive environment have high oral toxicity to honey bee larvae. *PLOS ONE* 9, e77547 (2014).
- vanEngelsdorp, D. et al. "Entombed Pollen": A new condition in honey bee colonies associated with increased risk of colony mortality. Journal of Invertebrate Pathology 101, 147–149 (2009).
- McArt, S. H., Urbanowicz, C., McCoshum, S., Irwin, R. E. & Adler, L. S. Landscape predictors of pathogen prevalence and range contractions in US bumblebees. *Proc R Soc B* 284, (2017).
- 22. Singh, N. Toxicity and compatibility of some commonly used insectificides with selected fungicides and herbicides against honey bee *Apis mellifera* L. (Govind Ballabh Pant University of Agriculture and Technology; Pantnagar, 2003).
- Rodrigues, C. G., Krüger, A. P., Barbosa, W. F. & Guedes, R. N. C. Leaf fertilizers affect survival and behavior of the Neotropical stingless bee *Friesella schrottkyi* (Meliponini: Apidae: Hymenoptera). *J Econ Entomol* 109, 1001–1008 (2016).
- Vandame, R. & Belzunces, L. P. Joint actions of deltamethrin and azole fungicides on honey bee thermoregulation. *Neuroscience Letters* 251, 57–60 (1998).
- Lefebvre, B. & Bassand, D. Bee selectivity of MAVRIK®(taufluvalinate) in tank mix with ERIA®(Difenoconazole, Ergosterol Biosynthesis Inhibitor-EBI). Short, medium and long term effects under semi-fields conditions. *COLLOQUES-INRA* 71–78 (2001).
- Ramoutar, D., Cowles, R. S., Requintina Jr, E. & Alm, S. R. Synergism between demethylation inhibitor fungicides or gibberellin inhibitor plant growth regulators and bifenthrin in a pyrethroid-resistant population of *Listronotus maculicollis* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). *Journal of economic entomology* **103**, 1810–1814 (2010).
- Biddinger, D. J. *et al.* Comparative toxicities and synergism of apple orchard pesticides to *Apis mellifera* (L.) and *Osmia cornifrons* (Radoszkowski). *PLoS ONE* 8, e72587 (2013).
- Albert, J. L. Field-level fungicide exposure and repellency to honey bees *Apis mellifera* during orchard bloom in Michigan. (Michigan State University, 2018).
- Pilling, E. D. Evidence for pesticide synergism in the honey bee (Apis mellifera). Aspects of Applied Biology 31, 43–47 (1992).
- Pilling, E. D. & Jepson, P. C. Synergism between EBI fungicides and a pyrethroid insecticide in the honeybee (*Apis mellifera*). *Pesticide science* **39**, 293–297 (1993).
- 31. European Food Safety Authority. Conclusion on the peer review of the pesticide risk assessment of the active substance flutriafol. *EFSA Journal* **8**, 1868 (2010).
- Raimets, R. *et al.* Synergistic interactions between a variety of insecticides and an ergosterol biosynthesis inhibitor fungicide in dietary exposures of bumble bees (*Bombus terrestris* L.). *Pest Managment Science* 74, 541–546 (2018).
- DEFRA, R. and D. Assessing the impact of mixtures of pyrethroids and fungicides on honeybees. 1–20 (DEFRA, Central Science Laboratory, 2004).
- Thompson, H. M., Fryday, S. L., Harkin, S. & Milner, S. Potential impacts of synergism in honeybees (<i>Apis mellifera,/i>) of exposure to neonicotinoids and sprayed fungicides in crops. *Apidologie* 45, 545–553 (2014).
- Sanchez-Bayo, F. & Goka, K. Pesticide residues and bees a risk assessment. *PLoS ONE* 9, e94482 (2014).
- Hawthorne, D. J. & Dively, G. P. Killing them with kindness? In-hive medications may inhibit xenobiotic efflux transporters and endanger honey bees. *PLOS ONE* 6, e26796 (2011).

- Iwasa, T., Motoyama, N., Ambrose, J. T. & Roe, R. M. Mechanism for the differential toxicity of neonicotinoid insecticides in the honey bee, *Apis mellifera*. *Crop Protection* 23, 371–378 (2004).
- Johnson, R. M., Pollock, H. S. & Berenbaum, M. R. Synergistic interactions between in-hive miticides in <I>Apis mellifera</I>. *Journal of Economic Entomology* **102**, 474–479 (2009).
- Johnson, R. M., Wen, Z., Schuler, M. A. & Berenbaum, M. R. Mediation of pyrethroid insecticide toxicity to honey bees (Hymenoptera: Apidae) by cytochrome P450 monooxygenases. *Journal of economic entomology* 99, 1046–1050 (2006).
- Hagler, J. R., Waller, G. D. & Lewis, B. E. Mortality of honeybees (Hymenoptera: Apidae) exposed to permethrin and combinations of permethrin with piperonyl butoxide. *Journal of Apicultural Research* 28, 208–211 (1989).
- Zhu, Y. C., Yao, J., Adamczyk, J. & Luttrell, R. Synergistic toxicity and physiological impact of imidacloprid alone and binary mixtures with seven representative pesticides on honey bee (Apis mellifera). *PLoS One* 12, e0176837 (2017).
- Sgolastra, F. *et al.* Synergistic mortality between a neonicotinoid insecticide and an ergosterol-biosynthesis-inhibiting fungicide in three bee species. *Pest Management Science* **73**, 1236–1243 (2017).
- Robinson, A. *et al.* Comparing bee species responses to chemical mixtures: common response patterns? *PLOS ONE* **12**, e0176289 (2017).
- 44. Steffan, S. A. *et al.* Empirical. *Metagenomic, and Computational* (2017).
- 45. Simone-Finstrom, M. Proceedings of the 2018 American Bee Research Conference. *Bee World* **95**, 47–72 (2018).
- 46. Zaluski, R., Justulin, L. A. & Orsi, R. de O. Field-relevant doses of the systemic insecticide fipronil and fungicide pyraclostrobin impair mandibular and hypopharyngeal glands in nurse honeybees (Apis mellifera). *Sci Rep* **7**, (2017).
- Efrom, C. F. S., Redaelli, L. R., Meirelles, R. N. & Ourique, C. B. Sideeffects of pesticides used in the organic system of production on *Apis mellifera* Linnaeus, 1758. *Brazilian Archives of Biology and Technology* 55, 47–53 (2012).
- Tomé, H. V. V. *et al.* Agrochemical synergism imposes higher risk to Neotropical bees than to honeybees. *Royal Society Open Science* 4, 160866 (2017).
- 49. Mullin, C. A. Effects of 'inactive' ingredients on bees. *Curr Opin Insect Sci* **10**, 194–200 (2015).
- Carvalho, S. M., Carvalho, G. A., Carvalho, C. F., Bueno, C. F. & Baptista, A. P. M. Toxicity of acaricides/insecticides for citrus crop to the africanized honeybee *Apis mellifera* L. *São Paulo* **76**, 597–607 (2009).
- Besard, L. *et al.* Compatibility of traditional and novel acaricides with bumblebees (*Bombus terrestris*): a first laboratory assessment of toxicity and sublethal effects. *Pest Manag Sci* 66, 786–93 (2010).
- Devillers, J. *et al.* Comparative toxicity and hazards of pesticides to *Apis* and non-*Apis* bees. A chemometrical study. *SAR QSAR Environ Res* 14, 389–403 (2003).
- 53. Naumann, K. & Isman, M. B. Toxicity of a neem (*Azadirachta indica* A. Juss) insecticide to larval honey bees. *American Bee Journal* (1996).
- 54. Xavier, V. M. *et al.* Acute toxicity and sublethal effects of botanical insecticides to honey bees. *J Insect Sci* **15**, (2015).
- González-Gómez, R. et al. Effects of neem (Azadirachta indica) on honey bee workers and queens, while applied to control Varroa destructor. Journal of Apicultural Research 55, 413–421 (2016).
- Barbosa, W. F., De Meyer, L., Guedes, R. N. C. & Smagghe, G. Lethal and sublethal effects of azadirachtin on the bumblebee *Bombus terrestris* (Hymenoptera: Apidae). *Ecotoxicology* 24, 130–142 (2015).
- 57. Mommaerts, V. & Smagghe, G. *Side-effects of pesticides on the pollinator* Bombus: *an overview*. (In-Tech, 2011).

- Marletto, F., Patetta, A. & Manino, A. Laboratory assessment of pesticide toxicity to bumblebees. *Bulletin of insectology* 56, 155–158 (2003).
- Fisher, A., Colman, C., Hoffmann, C., Fritz, B. & Rangel, J. The effects of the insect growth regulators methoxyfenozide and pyriproxyfen and the acaricide bifenazate on honey bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae) forager survival. *J Econ Entomol* **111**, 510–516 (2018).
- Ellis, M. D., Siegfried, B. D. & Spawn, B. The effect of Apistan[®] on honey bee (*Apis mellifera* L). Responses to methyl parathion, carbaryl and bifenthrin exposure. *Apidologie* 28, 123–127 (1997).
- Johansen, C. A., Mayer, D. F., Eves, J. D. & Kious, C. W. Pesticides and Bees. 12, 6 (1983).
- 62. Smagghe, G., Deknopper, J., Meeus, I. & Mommaerts, V. Dietary chlorantraniliprole suppresses reproduction in worker bumblebees. *Pest management science* **69**, 787–791 (2013).
- 63. Kelley, A. G., Ling-Hsiu, L. & Berenbaum, M. You are what you eat: food-drug interaction in honey bees (*Apis mellifera*). (2017).
- Becker, R. Acute toxicity study on the impact of chlorpyrifos and propiconazole in *Apis mellifera*. (University of Nebraska - Lincoln, 2016).
- 65. Thompson, H. M. Assessing the exposure and toxicity of pesticides to bumblebees (*Bombus* sp.). *Apidologie* **32**, 305–321 (2001).
- Gels, J. A., Held, D. W. & Potter, D. A. Hazards of insecticides to the bumble bees <I>Bombus impatiens</I> (Hymenoptera: Apidae) foraging on flowering white clover in turf. *Journal of Economic Entomology* 95, 722–728 (2002).
- 67. Uhl, P., Awanbor, O., Schulz, R. S. & Brühl, C. A. Osmia bicornis is rarely an adequate regulatory surrogate species. Comparing its acute sensitivity towards multiple insecticides with regulatory Apis mellifera endpoints. *bioRxiv 366237* (2018). doi:10.1101/366237
- Bendahou, N., Bounias, M. & Fleche, C. Acute toxicity of cypermethrin and fenitrothion on honeybees (*Apis mellifera mellifera*) according to age, formulations and (chronic paralysis virus)/insecticide interaction. *J.Environ.Biol.* 18, 55–65 (1997).
- Clinch, P. G. The residual contact toxicity to honey bees of insecticides sprayed on to white clover (*Trifolium repens* I.) in the laboratory. *New Zealand Journal of Agricultural Research* 10, 289– 300 (1967).
- Ciarlo, T. J., Mullin, C. A., Frazier, J. L. & Schmehl, D. R. Learning impairment in honey bees caused by agricultural spray adjuvants. *PLOS ONE* 7, e40848 (2012).
- Gupta, P. R. & Chandel, R. S. Effects of diflubenzuron and penfluron on workers of *Apis cerana indica* F and *Apis mellifera* L. *Apidologie* 26, 3–10 (1995).
- 72. Tasei, J.-N. Effects of insect growth regulators on honey bees and non-Apis bees. A review. *Apidologie* **32**, 527–545 (2001).
- Abramson, C. I., Squire, J., Sheridan, A. & Mulder Jr, P. G. The effect of insecticides considered harmless to honey bees (*Apis mellifera*): proboscis conditioning studies by using the insect growth regulators tebufenozide and diflubenzuron. *Environmental Entomology* 33, 378– 388 (2004).
- 74. Thompson, H. M., Wilkins, S., Battersby, A. H., Waite, R. J. & Wilkinson, D. The effects of four insect growth-regulating (IGR) insecticides on honeybee (Apis mellifera L.) colony development, queen rearing and drone sperm production. *Ecotoxicology* 14, 757– 769 (2005).
- Johnson, R. M. & Percel, E. G. Effect of a fungicide and spray adjuvant on queen-rearing success in honey bees (Hymenoptera: Apidae). J Econ Entomol 106, 1952–1957 (2013).
- Emmett, B. J. & Archer, B. M. The toxicity of diflubenzuron to honey bee (*Apis mellifera* L.) colonies in apple orchards. *Plant Pathology* 29, 177–183 (1980).
- 77. Steen, J. J. M. van der. The effect of the size of the bumble bee (Bombus terrestris L.) on the susceptibility to the pesticide dimethoate 40%. in *Proceedings 7th international symposium of the*

ICPBR Bee Protection group: hazards of pesticides to bees at Universite d'Avignon, France, 07-09 Septembre 1999 213–216 (2001).

- Taséi, J.-N. & Dinet, P. Effets comparés de deux pyréthrinoides de synthèse et de trois insecticides organophosphorés sur les mégachiles (Megachile rotundata F.= pacifica Pz.). *Apidologie* 12, 363–376 (1981).
- Mayer, D. F., Lunden, J. D. & Kovacs, G. Susceptibility of four bee species (Hymenoptera: Apoidea) to field weathered insecticide residues. *Journal of the Entomological Society of British Columbia* 94, 27–30 (1997).
- Vidau, C. *et al.* Exposure to sublethal doses of fipronil and thiacloprid highly increases mortality of honeybees previously infected by Nosema ceranae. *PLoS one* 6, e21550 (2011).
- Stanley, J., Sah, K., Jain, S. K., Bhatt, J. C. & Sushil, S. N. Evaluation of pesticide toxicity at their field recommended doses to honeybees, Apis cerana and A. mellifera through laboratory, semi-field and field studies. *Chemosphere* **119**, 668–674 (2015).
- Gradish, A. E., Scott-Dupree, C. D. & Cutler, G. C. Susceptibility of *Megachile rotundata* to insecticides used in wild blueberry production in Atlantic Canada. *Journal of Pest Science* 85, 133–140 (2012).
- Gradish, A. E., Scott-Dupree, C. D., Frewin, A. J. & Cutler, G. C. Lethal and sublethal effects of some insecticides recommended for wild blueberry on the pollinator Bombus impatiens. *The Canadian Entomologist* 144, 478–486 (2012).
- Nation, J. L. & Robinson, F. A. Gibberellic acid: effects of feeding in an artificial diet for honeybees. *Science* 152, 1765–1766 (1966).
- Marchetti, S., Barbattini, R. & D'AGARU, M. Comparative effectiveness of treatments used to control *Varroa jacobsoni* Oud. *Apidologie* 15, 363–378 (1984).
- Ellis, M. D. & Baxendale, F. P. Toxicity of seven monoterpenoids to tracheal mites (Acari: Tarsonemidae) and their honey bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae) hosts when applied as fumigants. *Journal of Economic Entomology* **90**, 1087–1091 (1997).
- Whittington, R., Winston, M. L., Melathopoulos, A. P. & Higo, H. A. Evaluation of the botanical oils neem, thymol, and canola sprayed to control Varroa jacobsoni Oud.(Acari: Varroidae) and Acarapis woodi (Acari: Tarsonemidae) in colonies of honey bees (Apis mellifera L., Hymenoptera: Apidae). *American Bee Journal* 140, 567–572 (2000).
- Floris, I., Satta, A., Cabras, P., Garau, V. L. & Angioni, A. Comparison between two thymol formulations in the control of *Varroa destructor*: effectiveness, persistence, and residues. *Journal of economic entomology* 97, 187–191 (2004).
- Imdorf, A., Bogdanov, S., Ochoa, R. I. & Calderone, N. W. Use of essential oils for the control of *Varroa jacobsoni* Oud. in honey bee colonies. *Apidologie* **30**, 209–228 (1999).
- Leza, M., Watrous, K. M., Bratu, J. & Woodard, S. H. Effects of neonicotinoid insecticide exposure and monofloral diet on nestfounding bumblebee queens. *Proc. R. Soc. B* 285, 20180761 (2018).
- Scott-Dupree, C. D., Conroy, L. & Harris, C. R. Impact of currently used or potentially useful insecticides for canola agroecosystems on Bombus impatiens (Hymenoptera: Apidae), Megachile rotundata (Hymentoptera: Megachilidae), and Osmia lignaria (Hymenoptera: Megachilidae). *Journal of Economic Entomology* **102**, 177–182 (2009).
- 92. Pashte, V. V. & Patil, C. S. Impact of different insecticides on the activity of bees on sunflower. *Res Crops2017* **18**, 153–6 (2017).
- Pilling, E. D., Bromleychallenor, K. A. C., Walker, C. H. & Jepson, P. C. Mechanism of synergism between the pyrethroid Insecticide λ-Cyhalothrin and the imidazole fungicide prochloraz, in the honeybee (*Apis mellifera* L.). *Pesticide biochemistry and physiology* **51**, 1–11 (1995).
- Mayer, D. F., Kovacs, G. & Lunden, J. D. Field and laboratory tests on the effects of cyhalothrin on adults of *Apis mellifera*, *Megachile rotundata* and *Nomia melanderi*. *Journal of apicultural research* 37, 33–37 (1998).

- Torchio, P. F. Relative toxicity of insecticides to the honey bee, alkali bee, and alfalfa leafcutting bee (Hymenoptera: Apidae, Halictidae, Megachilidae). *Journal of the Kansas Entomological Society* 446–453 (1973).
- Drescher, W. & Geusen-Pfister, H. Comparative testing of the oral toxicity of acephate, dimethoate and methomyl to honeybees, bumblebees and syrphidae. in VI International Symposium on Pollination 288 133–138 (1990).
- 97. Cutler, G. C. & Scott-Dupree, C. D. Novaluron: prospects and limitations in insect pest management. *Pest Technology 1.1* (2007).
- Mommaerts, V., Sterk, G. & Smagghe, G. Hazards and uptake of chitin synthesis inhibitors in bumblebees *Bombus terrestris*. *Pest Management Science: formerly Pesticide Science* 62, 752–758 (2006).
- 99. Hodgson, E. W., Pitts-Singer, T. L. & Barbour, J. D. Effects of the insect growth regulator, novaluron on immature alfalfa leafcutting bees, *Megachile rotundata*. J Insect Sci **11**, (2011).
- Fine, J. D., Cox-Foster, D. L. & Mullin, C. A. An inert pesticide adjuvant synergizes viral pathogenicity and mortality in honey bee larvae. *Scientific Reports* 7, 40499 (2017).
- Thompson, H. M. & Hunt, L. V. Extrapolating from honeybees to bumblebees in pesticide risk assessment. *Ecotoxicology* 8, 147–166 (1999).
- Piccolomini, A. M., Whiten, S. R., Flenniken, M. L., O'Neill, K. M. & Peterson, R. K. D. Acute toxicity of permethrin, deltamethrin, and etofenprox to the alfalfa leafcutting bee. *J Econ Entomol* **111**, 1001– 1005 (2018).
- Appel, A. G. Knockdown efficiency and materials' compatibility of wasp and hornet spray formulations to honey bees (Hymenoptera: Apidae). *Journal of economic entomology* 83, 1925–1931 (1990).
- 104. Fourrier, J. *et al.* Larval exposure to the juvenile hormone analog pyriproxyfen disrupts acceptance of and social behavior performance in adult honeybees. *PLOS ONE* **10**, e0132985 (2015).
- Mommaerts, V., Sterk, G. & Smagghe, G. Bumblebees can be used in combination with juvenile hormone analogues and ecdysone agonists. *Ecotoxicology* 15, 513–521 (2006).
- 106. Mayes, M. A., Thompson, G. D., Husband, B. & Miles, M. M. Spinosad toxicity to pollinators and associated risk. in *Reviews of*

Environmental Contamination and Toxicology **179**, 37–71 (Springer New York, 2003).

- Morandin, L. A., Winston, M. L., Franklin, M. T. & Abbott, V. A. Lethal and sub-lethal effects of spinosad on bumble bees (*Bombus impatiens* Cresson). *Pest Manag Sci* 61, 619–26 (2005).
- Tomé, H. V. V., Barbosa, W. F., Martins, G. F. & Guedes, R. N. C. Spinosad in the native stingless bee *Melipona quadrifasciata*: regrettable non-target toxicity of a bioinsecticide. *Chemosphere* **124**, 103–109 (2015).
- Kang, M. & Jung, C. Ecotoxicology of several acaricides used in apple orchards to the honeybee, Apis mellifera : from the laboratory to the field study. *Journal of Apiculture* 25, 155–161 (2010).
- Baptista, A. P. M., Carvalho, G. A., Carvalho, S. M., Carvalho, C. F. & Bueno Filho, J. S. de S. Toxicity of pesticides used in citrus crop to *Apis mellifera*. *Ciência Rural* **39**, 955–961 (2009).
- 111. Ramanaidu, K. Blueberry spanworm, *Itame argillacearia* (Packard) and bumble bee, *Bombus impatiens* (Cresson) susceptibility to new biorational insecticides. (2011).
- 112. Maus, C. Ecotoxicological profile of the insecticide spirotetramat. Bayer CropScience Journal 23
- Ellis, C., Park, K. J., Whitehorn, P., David, A. & Goulson, D. The neonicotinoid insecticide thiacloprid impacts upon bumblebee colony development under field conditions. *Environ. Sci. Technol.* **51**, 1727– 1732 (2017).
- Woodcock, B. A. *et al.* Country-specific effects of neonicotinoid pesticides on honey bees and wild bees. *Science* **356**, 1393–1395 (2017).
- Elston, C., Thompson, H. M. & Walters, K. F. A. Sub-lethal effects of thiamethoxam, a neonicotinoid pesticide, and propiconazole, a DMI fungicide, on colony initiation in bumblebee (Bombus terrestris) micro-colonies. *Apidologie* 44, 563–574 (2013).
- Sandrock, C. *et al.* Sublethal neonicotinoid insecticide exposure reduces solitary bee reproductive success: Loss of pollinator fitness. *Agricultural and Forest Entomology* **16**, 119–128 (2014).
- Coulon, M. *et al.* Metabolisation of thiamethoxam (a neonicotinoid pesticide) and interaction with the Chronic bee paralysis virus in honeybees. *Pesticide Biochemistry and Physiology* 144, 10–18 (2018).

Sample Pollination Services Contract

This sample contract is provided as a service and is not a substitute for legal advice.

This agreement dated ______ is made between the following parties:

Beekeeper's name:

Grower's name:

CONTACT INFORMATION					
	Beekeeper	Grower			
Mailing address:					
Phone number(s):					
Emergency phone number:					
Email address:					

The parties agree to the following terms

CROP AND COLONY OVERVIEW					
This agreement involves the 20	growing season				
Crop to be pollinated by honey	bee colonies. This				
agreement is for crop varieties	that are in flower.				
Address and/or GPS coordinate	es of orchard/field				
where the hives will be placed			-		
Date of colony placement*		Date of colony removal*			
		grower will provide <u>hours</u> notice to	the beekeeper		
regarding when colonies should	be placed and remove	ed	7		
No. of hives rented		Price of a standard hive rental	\$		
Total anticipated rental price	\$	Date(s) on which the rental fee is			
	Ŧ	payable to the beekeeper			
Describe in detail or illustrate the colony placement in the orchard					
The groups will provide right of					
The grower will provide right of		Vac	No		
beekeepers visiting the property	so that sine can	Yes	No		
manage colonies					
Before services are provided, the locate a holding yard to place c					
		Yes	No		
that they require movement to a spray	avolu a pesticide				
A water source will be provided	to the honey has	Bookoopor Crow	vor		
colonies by the following party	to the noney bee	Beekeeper Grower			
		No water will be pro			
		plicable federal, state and local laws	, including		
pesticide label restrictions designed to protect bees.					

The **beekeeper** agrees to provide colonies of the following standards:

COLONY STATUS OF A STANDARD HIVE					
Colony configuration (2 deeps, 1 deep, etc.)					
Minimum frames of bees in each hive					
Minimum frames of brood in each hive					
Pounds of food stores	lbs				
Presence of a laying queen					
Colonies are free of American Foulbrood					
The beekeeper agrees to open and demonstrate the health and status of colonies randomly selected by the					
grower at least one (1) time following placement of the hives and thereafter as reasonably requested by the					
grower.					
The beekeeper will maintain colonies in good pollinating condition by providing feed, medication, and mite					
treatments as needed					

The grower agrees to the following responsibilities:

GENERAL RESPONSIBILITIES

The grower will provide a suitable place(s) for the hives that are accessible by truck or other vehicles The grower will hold the beekeeper harmless from any and all claims of injury or property damage arising from beekeeper's performance of this contract, including but not limited to, claims arising from bee stings to animals or people, and claims for field or crop damage or loss resulting from the use of beekeepers vehicle(s).

MINIMIZING RISK OF PESTICIDE EXPOSURE

The following pesticides or agricultural chemicals are mutually ag	reed to be used	d while the bees a	re on the
crop:			
1. 2.			
3. 4.			
5. 6.			
7. 8.			
9. 10.			
The beekeeper will be notified of an application of a pesticide in the	nis above list	Yes	No
The beekeeper will be notified at the emergency contact (number/email address) provided above of an application of a pesticide that is not included in this above list		Yes	No
The number of hours notice the grower agrees to give the beekeeper before a pesticide is applied to a crop (e.g., 48 hrs)			hrs
If a pesticide not included in the above list will be applied during pollination, the grower shall assume the costs to move the colonies away from and back to the crop. State the cost of moving colonies		\$	
The grower will compensate the beekeeper for any colonies that died from acute pesticide poisoning events while present or within one month of pollinating this crop. Cause of death must be verified by the state apiculturist, state inspector, or Department of Environmental Conservation. State the cost of compensation per colony		\$	
The grower will dispose of all pesticide products in a manner that searching for a source of water	bees will not be	e able to contact i	t while

Additional agreements:

ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

Prior to placing colonies for pollination, either party can terminate this contract should events occur beyond his/her control that prevent him or her from fulfilling the obligations as outlined (e.g., unexpected colony deaths, unexpected damage or disease of crops, etc.).

If disputes arise that cannot be resolved through communication or small claims court, they will be settled by arbitration. Either party may request arbitration by providing written notice to the other at the contact information provided above by certified mail, return receipt requested. Within 10 days of receipt of such written request, each party will select one arbitrator and the two arbitrators will select a third. After reviewing the case, the decision of any two arbitrators will be binding. Cost of arbitration will be equally divided between the two parties. This contract shall be governed by New York law.

Signature of beekeeper:

Date:

Signature	of grower	:

Date: _____

This document was prepared by the Dyce Lab of Honey Bee Studies, Cornell University ©2018